

**ULSTER COUNTY RESOURCE RECOVERY AGENCY
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL BOARD MEETING
DECEMBER 10, 2018**

The Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency held a Special Board Meeting on December 10, 2018 at 999 Flatbush Road, Kingston, NY.

The proceedings were convened at 2:16pm.

The following Board members were present: Chairman Fred Wadnola (arrived at 2:16pm), Vice Chairman David Gordon, Treasurer Charles Landi, Member Jack Hayes (absent), and Member Brian Devine.

Also present were: Executive Director Timothy Rose, Counsel/Secretary Kenneth Gilligan, Controller Tim DeGraff (excused), Operations Manager Charlie Whittaker (excused), Compliance Officer Tom Briggs (excused), Acting Recycling Coordinator Melinda France (excused), and Clerical Secretary Brenna Whitaker.

From the public: Daily Freeman reporter William Kemble, City of Kingston Mayor Steve Noble, City of Kingston DPW Supervisor Ed Norman, videographer Clark Richters, Greenway Environmental owner Shabazz Jackson, Legislator Manna Jo Greene (arrived at 2:30pm), Legislator Laura Petit (arrived at 3:00pm), and City of Kingston residents Nick Coppola, Sarah Wenh, and Tanya Garment.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS

No Chairman's comments.

COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next Regular Board Meeting will be held on December 26, 2018 at 12:00pm at the Agency's Main Office at 999 Flatbush Road in Kingston.

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

The purpose of this meeting is to discuss the City of Kingston's request to extend the Agency's acceptance of single stream recycling (SSR).

Mayor Noble read a letter to the Board detailing his request with a timetable for the City's rollout of dual stream recycling (DSR).

Main points of the Mayor's letter included:

- The City is requesting a six month extension to accept their SSR while they transition away from SSR.
- The City's transfer station does not have the staffing or equipment required to process SSR.
- The Common Council has approved a bond for a \$400,000 bond to purchase new recycling totes.
- Advertisements for bids to provide totes will go out this month, with a vendor being selected in January. Totes are expected to be delivered by March. Distribution of totes is expected in May. SSR to DSR transition is expected to be completed in June.
- The City has a plan to educate residents for the transition, including brochures in English and Spanish, in-person trainings, social media campaigns, newsletters, and special events.
- The City is willing to continue to pay the varying monthly costs of SSR to the Agency.

Ensuing discussion included the following main points:

- Charles Landi questioned what the Agency is able to provide for the City that it cannot accomplish on its own. He pointed out the City's 8 acre transfer station, stating that the City should be able to process its own SSR at their facility using their own equipment.

Mayor Noble said that the City's transfer station has not been fully functional since the Agency closed Jockey Hill. He stated that the transfer station is only open 2 half days per week and collects only a small amount of MSW and SSR, and that there is no heavy equipment permanently located there. He added that the transfer station is also not up to current environmental and safety standards to be fully operational, and cannot handle current capacity.

- Charles Landi asked Mayor Noble if he has been in contact with Republic to take their SSR directly.

Mayor Noble stated that he did reach out to Republic (who also currently process the Agency's SSR) and they told him that they would provide trailers to the City for SSR, however, the City does not have the staff to load the trailers.

- Mayor Noble expressed his frustration that the Agency has not been reasonable in asking the City to overhaul its SSR recycling operation in six months, which took 4 years to fully implement. He stated that the City is doing everything it can to comply with the Agency's policy change, and that he feels it is unreasonable not to grant an extension when the City has shown what steps they have taken to make the transition. He also noted that it is the Agency's duty as a Public Benefit Corporation to manage the waste and recycling for Ulster County's municipalities.
- Charles Landi asked Mayor Noble if he is aware of just how much SSR is costing the City right now.

Mayor Noble responded that he is aware, and absolutely willing to pay all of the Agency's costs for SSR going forward just as the City is doing now.

Tim Rose added that currently Republic is not charging the Agency for hauling, but as of January 1st they will be charging upwards of \$20-\$30/ton. They also will not be able to guarantee us trucks.

- Charles Landi stated that the space in the MRF currently used for SSR is no longer going to be available, since the Agency is in the process of purchasing a bagging machine for its compost operation and placing it in that area. If the Agency was to extend acceptance of SSR, then it would be losing out on revenue from the purchase of compost.
- David Gordon explained that the Board came to its decision to deny Mayor Noble's extension request at the last meeting because no one from the City was there to explain how much time was needed as well as why the City is incapable of processing its own SSR and they only had the Agency staff's knowledge to go on.

Fred Wadnola agreed, asking Mayor Noble why it took the City so long to make a decision on how it would deal with SSR after the Agency voted to stop accepting it in June, when the Town of Ulster and Saugerties were able to make arrangements for themselves well before the deadline.

Mayor Noble responded that the City is the only municipality in Ulster County that uses its own trucks and staff to pick up waste and recycling, therefore the operations are much more involved and changing course is very difficult. He stated that it is actually pretty remarkable that the City accomplished so much in such a short period of time. Mayor Noble went on to explain all of the steps that must be accomplished before the City is fully transitioned to SSR, including assembling 7,000 new totes, putting new stickers on the existing totes, delivering the totes door to door, and educating the public so that the product delivered to the Agency is clean.

- Brian Devine asked Tim Rose about the impact of an extension to the Agency.

Tim Rose said that one of the biggest issues relates to Republic not being able to send us trucks, and the Agency not having its own trucks available to haul SSR to Republic. He also noted that the Agency's 2019 budget does not include the acceptance of SSR.

David Gordon stated that he does understand the City's need for an extension. He added that he believes that an extension will cause the Agency to incur massive unforeseen costs, and that the City and the Agency need to figure out if the 6 months can be shortened by working together.

- Jack Hayes posed the question of what would happen if Republic decided to stop accepting SSR. Mayor Noble responded that he just spoke with Republic recently, and they stated that they have just been purchased by a large company, have invested in expanding their plant, and have no plans to stop accepting SSR.

Tim Rose said that Republic has been limiting the amount of SSR they will take from the Agency. Mayor Noble said that in the case of an emergency where Republic will not accept SSR, the City will attempt to have County Waste or Waste Management take it.

- Mayor Noble noted that he appreciates the board taking time to consider this request and understands that it is a complicated issue. He said that his argument now is similar to the one he made at the Public Hearing earlier this year, where he told the Board that he needed time to implement change. He added that he understands that the space in the Agency's MRF is valuable as it relates to the compost operation, he believes the benefit is greatly outweighed by the benefit to 24,000 citizens of the City while they transition to DSR.
- Mayor Noble stated the point of moving to SSR in the first place was that it was easier for residents, therefore caused the recycling rates in the City to increase by 15%.

Tim Rose responded that Mayor Noble is incorrect. He explained that the true reason for switching to SSR was that the haulers wanted to save money on the street, under the guise that it increases recycling rates. In reality, 30%-40% of the materials that come in as SSR end up in the landfill due to contamination.

- David Gordon stated that he wanted to move the meeting along and come to a decision on a next step. He told Tim Rose that he wants him to give his professional opinion on whether or not he believes that the City is truly not able to handle their own SSR. He noted the deadline of the December 26th Board Meeting.

Tim Rose and the Board collectively discussed if there is even enough time to make an informed decision by the date. The Board agreed that Charlie Whittaker needs to visit the City's transfer station to assess their capability.

- Jack Hayes said that if the Board does approve an extension, it should be contingent upon Republic accepting the material. The Board collectively agreed.

Brian Devine proposed a 1 month extension so that the Agency staff can figure out if the City's transfer station is viable.

Tim Rose stated that he needs there to be a decision as soon as possible, because he will need to request trucks from Republic and they may not even have any available. He also mentioned that he won't be in the office for the next few days.

- Discussion continued about how the Agency would manage this extension on the operational end, especially with the shortage of drivers available.

Mayor Noble offered to loan one of the City's drivers to the Agency, so that the only thing the Agency would need to worry about is its equipment.

Tim Rose said he would need to contact the Agency’s insurance company to consult on the matter, but that he is agreeable to that solution.

- Tim Rose stated that he would contact the County and tell them that we will not be starting our bagging operation right away.
- The Board decided to make its final decision on the extension at the next Board Meeting on December 26, after the Board and staff has had time to gather information.

CLOSING

Motion to ADJOURN the December 10, 2018 Special Board Meeting was made by Fred Wadnola, moved by Brian Devine and seconded by Charles Landi. 5 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 absent.

January 30, 2019.

Motion to approve the above transcribed Minutes of the December 10, 2018 Special Board Meeting was made by _____, moved by _____ and seconded by _____. 5 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 absent. The Minutes were APPROVED by the Board.

Transcribed by: Brenna Whitaker, Clerical Secretary. Minutes are recorded.

Signatures:

Fred Wadnola, Chairman

Ken Gilligan, Secretary

Brenna Whitaker, Clerical Secretary